A first approach to Restorative Justice

Dr. Jacopo Bruni
Forensic and developmental psychologist
Specialist in psychodiagnosis and psychological assessment
Psycho-forensic expert witness
School psychologist in Istituto San Leone Magno

New directions in research on well being: psychological process in everyday contexts
Prof. Irene Petruccelli
Restorative justice may be considered a model of justice that:
involve the victim, the offender and the whole community looking for solutions to the effects of the generated conflict, in order to encourage:

- the restoration of the damage
- the reconciliation of the part
- the reinforcement of the collective sense of security

In contrast with «traditional» criminal justice, in which, pragmatically, main questions are «Who deserve to be punished?» and «Which sentence?», restorative justice has a different paradigm «What may be done to restore the damage?» (Zehr, 1990)
Feedback of prevention in restorative justice

McCold, 2005, in Wright, 2010

Offence → Demages → Needs

Causes → Create → Request

Prevent → Restore → Encounter

Restorative responses
Restorative justice and restorative practices

European Forum for Restorative Justice: There is no single definition of restorative justice. Restorative justice is seen as a broad approach oriented towards repairing, as far as possible, the harm caused by crime or other transgressions. A core element of restorative justice is active participation by the victim, the offender and possibly other parties.

Wachtel (2005) said: «the science to restore and develop social capital, social discipline, emotive welfare and civil involvement through partecipated learning and decisional processes»

Dr. Jacopo Bruni ~ April 15th 2021
"Restorative justice programme" means any programme that uses restorative processes and seeks to achieve restorative outcomes.

"Restorative process" means any process in which the victim and the offender, and, where appropriate, any other individuals or community members affected by a crime, participate together actively in the resolution of matters arising from the crime, generally with the help of a facilitator. Restorative processes may include mediation, conciliation, conferencing and sentencing circles.

"Restorative outcome" means an agreement reached as a result of a restorative process. Restorative outcomes include responses and programmes such as reparation, restitution and community service, aimed at meeting the individual and collective needs and responsibilities of the parties and achieving the reintegration of the victim and the offender.

Dr. Jacopo Bruni ~ April 15th 2021
First step: building formal bridges
Second step: restorative conferences with the community
Third step: Focus group
Fourth step: Restorative bridges
* Well-being
* Ecology of responsibility
* Perceived self-efficacy and collective efficacy
* Social capital
Amartya Sen:

a multidimensional category constituted by:

* **CAPABILITIES**: the set of skills, potentialities, attitudes, abilities that constitute what we might call the "personal power" of the subjects

* **OPERATIONS** or "states of doing or being": the objective conditions that allow people to reach and maintaining results with respect to the quality of life.
Responsability, in the ecological model by Gaetano De Leo, represents a constitutively interactive concept, culturally and socially constructed to connect all the parts involved. Responsibility is a relational process, an emerging quality in the systems of reciprocity and interaction that is built up in the relationships between subject, action, institutions and society. It is at the same time a framework that organizes the relationships between individuals, actions, norms and collectivity.
Looking at people as architects of their own affective and cognitive functioning, bearers of resources and capable of governing their own levels of well-being in interaction with their own living environment, means attaching importance to constitutive relational and contextual variables of wellness itself. Lent and Brown, in the field of positive psychology and in a unifying perspective, propose a socio-cognitive model that considers well-being a state of personal satisfaction to which people tend through a process that includes cognitive, behavioral, social, personal and emotive variables including those susceptible to intervention and change such as perceived self-efficacy, the effective pursuit of one's own objectives, the material and social support of the context.
a community that wants to become restorative and relational has to challenge the progressive and increasingly marked weakening of social ties.

the concept of binding value to underline the functions performed by the quality of social ties in the development, even economic, of a local community that would thus be better able to reduce opportunistic action in favor of the cooperative one.

social capital by Putnam: a "good" that people and groups can dispose of, consisting of immaterial indicators such as the degree of trust, positive or negative assessments, social credit, support, influence and expectations of mutual commitment (concept often linked to social "reputation" and civic virtues).
* Reparative practices build social capital and have positive implications for all social contexts, from families to schools to workplaces. Reparative practices support a society based on participation and mutual trust, a society where citizens take more responsibility for their own life paths. Leaders and governments have a role in achieving social well-being, but support from our social networks is equally important: family, friends, neighbors and the community [...].

* Fundamental hypothesis → people are happier, more cooperative and more productive, and are more likely to make positive changes when those in positions of authority do things with them rather than to them or to them
*Social discipline window (Wachtel & McCold, 2001)*

- **TO** punitive (authoritarian)
- **WITH** restorative (authoritative)
- **NOT** neglectful (irresponsible)
- **FOR** permissive (paternalistic)

Control (limit-setting, discipline) — HIGH to LOW
Support (encouragement, nurture) — LOW to HIGH
*Responsability, respect, relationship*

Models of addressing harmful behaviour and its aftermath

- **High Accountability**
  - Do to Out of anger
  - Be punitive
  - Stigmatising
  - Coercive
  - Retributive

- **Low Accountability**
  - Move away from Out of fear
  - Be neglectful
  - Manage risk
  - Withdraw
  - Avoid

- **High Social Support**
  - Do with Out of respect
  - Be restorative
  - Inclusive
  - Participative
  - Transformative

- **Low Social Support**
  - Do for Out of sympathy
  - Be permissive
  - Protective
  - Interventionist
  - Rescuing

*Adapted form McCold and Wachtel’s Social Discipline Window*

Chapman, 2005

Dr. Jacopo Bruni ~ April 15th 2021
Restorative justice engages those most affected by an injustice in a process that restores what has been lost, damaged and violated by the harm that has resulted from the injustice.
Wherever people live or work together or when they encounter each other in a diverse society there is a basic need to be treated equitably and with respect. When this does not occur they experience harm and they need justice.

Harm is not confined to crime and the need for justice is not restricted to the criminal justice system. It is just as keenly felt in families, schools, community and organisational life and in major social and political conflict.
Restorative Youth Conferences in Northern Ireland

Areas of research...
Community system
* Community Restorative Justice Ireland
* Alternatives NI

School system
Children’s Services
* Family Group Conferences
* Children’s Units

State system
Youth
* Low risk - Police restorative cautioning
* Medium risk - Public Prosecution Service referral for diversionary conference by Youth Conference Service
* High risk - Youth Court referral by Youth Conference Service
* Intensive Support and Supervision Programme

Adults
* Probation Service
* Prison Service

Northern Ireland and Restorative Justice

Dr. Jacopo Bruni ~ April 15th 2021
*Under 18 years old children and young people who admit to a criminal offence.

*Criminal Justice (Northern Ireland) Act 2002

The purpose:
* To devolve decision making to participants
* To meet the victim’s needs
* To reduce the risk of reoffending
* Consistent with children’s rights and proportionality

*Youth Conference Group

Dr. Jacopo Bruni ~ April 15th 2021
Participants

Mandatory
* Youth Conference Coordinator
* Young person
* Parent, guardian or appropriate adult
* Police officer
Young person’s lawyer is entitled to attend

Non-mandatory
* Victim
* Victim’s supporters
* Young person’s supporters
* Other appropriate professionals
* Appropriate representatives of the community
Options for victim participation in conferences

Attendance 50%
- Face to face meeting

Additional Participation 18% via;
- Video and telephone conference
- One way screen
- Recorded message (video, audio, written)
- Representative attends

No participation 32%
1. Apology
2. Reparation work
3. Financial compensation
4. Supervision by an adult
5. Participate in activities or programmes to address offending
6. Restrictions on actions
7. Treatment for mental condition or alcohol or drugs.
8. Electronic tagging
9. Custody

Action plan must be approved

*Action Plan options*
Outcomes for Youth Conferences

* Victim participation → 67%
* Victim and young person satisfaction → 90%+

* The median time taken for cases to reach completion via the youth engagement process was 46 days. 80% of all cases had completed within 89 days.

* 94% successful completion of plans
* Reoffending 38%
* Reoffending for all other community disposals 52%; for custody sentences 71%
* England and Wales put about twice as many young people into custody as Northern Ireland
*The co-ordinator encourages, motivates and enables the young person to keep to his Conference Plan.

*Incidents of non-compliance are dealt with (if needed engaging the family in a Family Group conference to resolve the difficulties).

*Ultimately a young person may be returned to Court / referred back to the PPS if fails to comply with the plan.
Restorative justice with young people who persistently offend or who commit serious offences can:

- Reduce offending
- Satisfy victims
- Reduce the use of detention
- Reduce costs
*Why Restorative Justice?
* To support governments, organisations, practitioners, trainers and researchers to develop restorative justice throughout society

* Fit for societies which are modern, democratic, diverse and complex.

* **Art. 1** The purpose of this Directive is to ensure that victims of crime receive appropriate information, support and protection and are able to participate in criminal proceedings.

* **Art. 2** gives some definitions:

* **Victims:**
  * a natural person who has suffered harm, including physical, mental or emotional harm or economic loss which was directly caused by a criminal offence
  * A family member

* ’Restorative justice’ means any process whereby the victim and the offender are enabled, if they freely consent, to participate actively in the resolution of matters arising from the criminal offence through the help of an impartial third party.

* **Directive 2012/29/EU**

---

Dr. Jacopo Bruni ~ April 15th 2021
When harm occurs most people want to move on and get back to their normal lives.

Restorative justice offers:

* A process through which a young person who has harmed another has the opportunity to be accountable, feel and express remorse, repair the harm and be reintegrated with respect

* A process through which the victim experiences justice, reparation and a commitment that it will not happen again.

* A process though which the community sees justice being done, feels safer and can offer support to the young person who has caused the harm.

Restorative justice can achieve this earlier, quicker and at less cost.

*Restoring the future*
Skills that enhance relationships

* Taking personal responsibility
* Listening to others
* Empathy and understanding others
* Expressing remorse
* Making and keeping commitments
* Letting things go and forgiving
A holistic policy framework

Level 4. Restorative culture and practices in detention and for reintegration

Level 3. Restorative conferences and circles of support and accountability to divert from detention

Level 2. Mediation to divert from entry into the criminal justice system

Level 1. Restorative parenting, family group conferences, mediation and restorative relationships in schools, restorative circles and mediation in the community.
ALTERNATIVE
Conflict in Intercultural Contexts
* Austria - the relationship between Muslim immigrants and longstanding residents in a social housing estate
* Hungary - the relationship between the Roma and other residents in a village
* Serbia and Northern Ireland - post-conflict society

* European projects
**State system**

* Defines the desired outcome in a measurable way - reduce offending
* Controls access to service - crime committed, offender detected and admits guilt, individualised, slow process out of sight
* Controls location of practice
* Defines roles - victim, offender, community

**Community**

* More concerned with the ‘hidden harm’.
* Seeks inclusion and active participation in a rapid response often to inter-group harm
* Feels safer and more confident ‘on the margins’
* Resists labels

*Findings: Restorative Justice*
The politics of identity sustain conflict and can stimulate violence.

Security responses control and manage conflict but do not transform it.

Difficult to resolve the cultural, relational and personal aspects of conflict.

*The limitations of politics*
Community is an active, reflexive social and communicative practice on how to live equitably with an increasingly diverse range of other identities. Through this practice community solidarity can be enlarged to include diversity while still being cohesive.

Identity is multi-dimensional and dynamic depending upon context and the purpose of the activity.

Justice is experienced through active participation which creates greater security through offering safe and just processes for people to move towards and communicate with those they fear.

*The critical importance of activation through communicative action*
Restorative practices in school system
GRADUALLY INTRODUCING RESTORATIVE PRACTICES TO REPLACE RETRIBUTIVE PRACTICES WILL DECREASE BEHAVIOR INCIDENTS.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>0% RJ 100% RETRIBUTIVE</th>
<th>20% RJ 80% RETRIBUTIVE</th>
<th>50% RJ 50% RETRIBUTIVE</th>
<th>80% RJ 20% RETRIBUTIVE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Little structured time for community building is provided.</td>
<td>A few teachers use community building circles in classrooms.</td>
<td>Regular community building circles are held in classrooms.</td>
<td>A peer RJ group is used to address most conflicts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rules are established by adults with no input from students.</td>
<td>An RJ Coordinator addresses some behavior issues.</td>
<td>Teachers use circles to address harm and restore relationships as issues occur.</td>
<td>Retributive practices are reserved for severe, infrequent instances of harm.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time outs, phone calls home and suspension are primary disciplinary tactics.</td>
<td>Sometimes circles are used to address harm and healing with families and community.</td>
<td>Most times circles are used to address harm and healing with families and community.</td>
<td>Circles are always used to address harm and healing with families and community.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
*Think back to the last conflict you experienced at your school. Describe it:
(What happened? Where? Who was involved?)

*****************************************************************************
*****************************************************************************
*****************************************************************************
*****************************************************************************
*****************************************************************************
*****************************************************************************
*****************************************************************************

*Reflect on...
3 questions retributive justice asks:
* What law or rule was broken?
* Who broke it?
* What punishment is deserved?

3 questions restorative justice asks:
* What is the harm?
* What are the needs and obligations of all affected by the harm?
* How can all the affected parties create a plan to heal the harm as much as possible?

*Reflect on...*
*What is the difference in the types of responses you generate from retributive vs. restorative thinking?

*What problems has retributive thinking created in our community?

*What resources and supports would we need to embed restorative thinking in a school?
Restorative justice empowers students to resolve conflicts on their own and in small groups, and it's a growing practice at schools around the country. Essentially, the idea is to bring students together in peer-mediated small groups to talk, ask questions, and air their grievances.
7 Questions That Change School Discipline

- What happened?
- What part did you play in it?
- How did it happen?
- What can you do to repair the harm?
- How were you affected by what you did?
- Who else was affected by what you did?
- What do you need to make it right?
Restorative Practices

- Address and discuss the needs of the school community
- Build healthy relationships between educators and students
- Resolve conflict, hold individuals and groups accountable
- Reduce, prevent, and improve harmful behavior
- Repair harm and restore positive relationships
*Implementing Restorative Practice in Schools: A Practical Guide to Transforming School Communities by M. Thorsborne and P. Blood

*Better Than Carrots or Sticks: Restorative Practices for Positive Classroom Management by D. Smith, D. Fisher and N. Frey

*Restorative Justice Pocketbook by M. Thorsborne and D. Vinegrad

*A little bibliography
Restorative justice:
* is a different way of thinking about crime and our response to crime;
* focuses on repairing the harm caused by crime and reducing future harm through crime prevention;
* requires offenders to take responsibility for their actions and for the harm they have caused;
* seeks redress for victims, recompense by offenders and reintegration of both within the community;
* requires a cooperative effort by communities and the government.

*Take-home message*
* How does the studies on neuroscience support the efficacy of application of a restorative justice model?

* In this TED Talk dr. Dan Reisel explain his researches on inmates:

  ▶️ Click here to watch the video ◀️

  *Enjoy!!

* Homework
People, even more than things, have to be restored, renewed, revived, reclaimed, and redeemed; never throw out anyone.

Thanks

Dr. Jacopo Bruni
jacopo.bruni90@gmail.com